

**BEFORE THE OFFICE OF THE CO-INVESTIGATING JUDGES
EXTRAORDINARY CHAMBERS IN THE COURTS OF CAMBODIA**

FILING DETAILS

Case No: 004/07-09-2009-ECCC/OCIJ

Party Filing: AO An

Filed to: The Co-Investigating Judges

Original language: English

Date of document: 19 May 2016

CLASSIFICATION

**Classification of the document
suggested by the filing party:** CONFIDENTIAL

Classification by OCIJ: សាធារណៈ/Public

Classification Status:

Review of Interim Classification:

Records Officer Name:

Signature:



**AO AN'S SUBMISSION ON WHETHER AN ATTACK BY A
STATE OR ORGANISATION AGAINST MEMBERS OF ITS OWN
ARMED FORCES COULD QUALIFY AS A CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY UNDER
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW IN 1975-1979**

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Filed by:

The Co-Lawyers
MOM Luch
Richard ROGERS
Göran SLUITER

Distribution to:

The Co-Investigating Judges
Judge YOU Bunleng
Judge Michael BOHLANDER

The Co-Lawyers for YIM Tith
SO Mosseny
Suzana TOMANOVIĆ

All Civil Parties

The Co-Prosecutors
CHEA Leang
Nicholas KOUMJIAN

CAMBODIAN LAW**ECCC Law, Rules and Regulations**

1. Agreement between the United Nations and the Royal Government of Cambodia Concerning the Prosecution under Cambodian Law of Crimes Committed During the Period of Democratic Kampuchea, Article 12. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*
2. Law on the Establishment of the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia for the prosecution of crimes committed during the Period of Democratic Kampuchea, Arts 5, 33 *new*. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*
3. Internal Rules of the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia, Rule 21. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*

Cambodian Law

4. Cambodian Constitution, Arts. 31, 38. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*
5. 1956 Penal Code of Cambodia, Art. 6. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*

Orders, Decisions, Judgements and Memorandums

6. Case No. 004/07-09-2009, *Call for Submissions by the Parties in Cases 003 and 004 and Call for Amicus Curiae Briefs Request for Submissions*, D306, 19 April 2016, paras 3, 6, 11. *Not Attached – ECCC Case File.*
7. Case File No: 003/07-09-2009-ECCC-OCIJ, *Decision on MEAS Muth's Request for Clarification Concerning Crimes against Humanity and the Nexus with Armed Conflict*, D87/2/1.7/1, 5 April 2016, paras. 24, 26, 56, 57, 62-63. *Not Attached – ECCC Case File.*
8. Case No. 002/19-09-2007/ECCC/TC, *Case 002/01 Judgement*, E313, 7 Aug. 2014, paras. 185, 186.
9. Case No. 001/18-07-2007-ECCC/SC, *Appeal Judgement*, F28, 3 Feb. 2012, paras. 90, 91, 92, 93, 95, 96, 98-100.
10. Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-TC/SC(04), *Decision on Immediate Appeal by Khieu Samphan on Application for Immediate Release*, E50/3/1/4, 6 June 2011, E50/3/1/4, para. 31.
11. Case No. 002/19-09-2007 ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 145 & 146), *Decision on Appeal by Nuon Chea and Ieng Thirith against the Closing Order*, D427/2/15, 15 Feb. 2011, D427/2/15, paras. 134-144.

12. Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC38), *Decision on the Appeals against the Co-Investigative Judges Order on Joint Criminal Enterprise*, D97/15/9, 20 May 2010, paras 53, 60.

INTERNATIONAL LAW

Law, Rules and Regulations

Conventions

13. Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity, adopted 26 Nov. 1968, General Assembly Resolution 2391 (XXIII), entered into force 11 Nov. 1970, 754 UNTS 73, Art. I (b).
14. Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 23 May 1969, Art. 31.
15. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Arts. 14, 15(1). *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*

Charters

16. Charter of the International Military Tribunal, Annex to Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of the Major War Criminals of the European Axis, adopted and entered into force 8 Aug. 1945, 82 UNTS 279, Art. 6(c).
17. Charter of the International Military Tribunal for the Far East, General Order 1, General Headquarters Supreme Commander of the Allied Forces, 19 Jan. 1946, 4 Bevans 20, as amended 26 April 1946, 4 Bevans 27, Art. 5 (c).

Statutes of Courts

18. International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia Statute, Art. 5. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*
19. International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Statute, Art. 3. *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*
20. Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, Art. 22(2), 64 (7), 7(1), 7(2)(a). *Not included – ECCC Legal Compendium.*

UN General Assembly Resolution, Comments received from Governments

21. General Assembly Resolution. 177 (II), 21 Nov. 1947, para. (a).
22. General Assembly, *Comments Received from Governments Regarding the Draft Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind and the Question of Defining Aggression*, UN Doc. A/2162, 27 Aug. 1952, p. 28.

23. General Assembly, *Comments Received from Governments Regarding the Draft Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind and the Question of Defining Aggression*, UN Doc. A/2162/Add.1, 16 Sept. 1952.

Report

24. Report of the International Law Commission, UN GAOR, 5th Sess., Supp. No 12, U.N. Doc. A/1316 (1950), p. 377, para. 124.

Other

25. Control Council Law No 10, *Punishment of Persons Guilty of War Crimes, Crimes against Peace and against Humanity*, 20 Dec. 1945, 3 Official Gazette Control Council for Germany 50-55 (1946), Art II (a), II (1) (c).
26. Principles of International Law Recognized in the Charter of the Nuremberg Tribunal and in the Judgment of the Tribunal, with commentaries, *Yearbook of the International Law Commission (1950)*, Vol. II, pp. 374-378, Principle 6 (c).
27. Draft Code of Offences against the Peace and Security of Mankind, *Yearbook of the International Law Commission (1951)*, Vol. II, 134-137, Art. 2 (10).
28. *Yearbook of the International Law Commission (1954)*, Vol. I, *Summary records of the sixth session* (3 June - 28 July 1954), pp. 140-148, para. 36.

Jurisprudence

ICJ

29. *Territorial Dispute (Lybian Arab Jamahiriya/Chad)*, *Judgement*, ICJ, Reports 1994, para. 41. App 4

ICC

30. *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, ICC, ICC-01/04-01/06, *Decision on the confirmation of charges*, 29 Jan. 2007, para. 303.

ICTY

31. *Prosecutor v. Mrkšić*, ICTY, IT-95-13/1-A, *Appeal Judgement*, 5 May 2009, para. 32.
32. *Prosecutor v. Martić*, ICTY, IT-95-11-A, *Appeal Judgement*, 8 Oct. 2008, paras. 272-274, 297, 299. App 6
33. *Prosecutor v. Blaškić*, ICTY, IT-95-14-A, *Judgement*, 29 July 2004, paras. 103-116.
34. *Prosecutor v. Hadsihanovic, et al.*, ICTY, IT-01-47-AR72, *Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Challenging Jurisdiction in Relation to Command Responsibility*, 16 July 2003, para. 34.
35. *Prosecutor v. Vasiljevic*, ICTY, IT-98-32-T, *Judgement*, 29 Nov. 2002, para. 193.

36. *Prosecutor v. Tadić, et al.*, ICTY, IT-95-9, *Decision on Motion for Judicial Assistance to be Provided by SFOR and Others*, 18 Oct. 2000, para. 47.

37. *Prosecutor v. Delalic, et al.*, ICTY, IT-96-21-T, *Judgement*, 16 Nov. 1998, para. 402.

38. *Prosecutor v. Tadić*, ICTY, IT-94-1-T, *Trial Judgment*, 7 May 1997, para. 640.

ICTR

39. *Prosecutor v. Akayesu*, ICTR, ICTR-96-4-T, *Trial Judgment*, 2 Sept. 1998, para. 319

ECHR

40. *Kafkaris v. Cyprus*, ECHR, no. 21906/04, 12 Feb. 2008, para. 140.

41. *SW v. United Kingdom*, ECHR, no. 20166/92, 22 Nov. 1995, para. 36.

42. *Kokkinakis v. Greece*, ECHR, no. 14307/88, 25 May 1993, para. 52.

43. *Golder v. United Kingdom*, ECHR, no. 4451/70, 21 Feb. 1975, para. 30.

NATIONAL LAW FROM OTHER JURISDICTIONS

French law

44. French Penal Code, Art. 212-1.

French jurisprudence

45. Conseil Constitutionnel, *Décision n° 98-399 DC*, 'Loi relative à l'entrée et au séjour des étrangers en France et au droit d'asile', 5 mai 1998, paras. 7 et 8.

46. Conseil Constitutionnel, *Décision n° 80-127 DC*, 'Loi renforçant la sécurité et protégeant la liberté des personnes', 20 janvier 1981, para. 7.

47. Cass. Crim., 7 Jan. 2015, No 14-86850.

OTHER MATERIALS

Academic

48. Beth Van Schaack, *The Definition of Crimes Against Humanity: Resolving the Incoherence*, 37 Colum. J. Transnat'l L. 787, 1998-1999, pp. 789, 790, 802.

49. Antonio Cassese, *International Criminal Law (3rd ed., Oxford: 2013)*, pp. 33, 101, 102, 103, 141, 142, 153, 154.

50. Egon Schwelb, 'Crimes Against Humanity', *The British Yearbook of Int'l Law* (1946), 23rd Year of Issue, Geoffrey Cumberlege, Oxford Univ. Press, 178-226, pp. 190, 191.
51. Mohamed Elewa Badar, *From Nuremberg Charter to the Rome Statute: Defining the Elements of Crimes Against Humanity*, 5 *San Diego Int'l L.J.* 73, pp. 100, 102.
52. Joakim Dungel, *Defining Victims of Crimes Against Humanity: Martić and the ICC*, *Leiden Journal of Int'l Law*, 28 Oct. 2009, pp. 729, 734.
53. Goran Sluiter, 'Chapeau Elements' of Crimes against Humanity in the Jurisprudence of the UN Ad Hoc Tribunals, in Leila Nadya Sadat (ed.), *Forging a Convention for Crimes Against Humanity* (Cambridge University Press: Cambridge 2011), pp. 1, 21, 22, 30, 31.
54. Phyllis Hwang, *Defining Crimes against Humanity in the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court*, 22 *Fordham Int'l L.J.* 457 (Dec. 1998), pp. 465-466.
55. Hansdeep Singh, *Critique of the Mrkšić Trial Chamber (ICTY) Judgment: A Re-evaluation on Whether Soldiers Hors de Combat Are Entitled to Recognition as Victims of Crimes Against Humanity*, *Law and Practice of Int'l Courts and Tribunals* 8 (2009) 247-296, pp. 282-285.

Website

56. *Proposed International Convention for the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes Against Humanity ('Proposed Convention')*, Crimes Against Humanity Initiative, Washington University School of Law, Whitney R. Harris World Law Institute, Aug. 2010, available at <http://law.wustl.edu/harris/cah/docs/EnglishTreatyFinal.pdf>.